

Critical Systems Heuristic

Sources of influence	Boundary judgments informing a system of interest (S)			
	<i>Social roles (stakeholders)</i>	<i>Specific concerns (stakes)</i>	<i>Key problems (stakeholding issues)</i>	
Sources of motivation	1. <u>Beneficiary</u> Who ought to be/is the intended beneficiary of the system (S)?	2. <u>Purpose</u> What ought to be/is the purpose of S?	3. <u>Measure of improvement</u> What ought to be/is S's measure of success	The involved
Sources of control	4. <u>Decision maker</u> Who ought to be/is in control of the conditions of success of S?	5. <u>Resources</u> What conditions of success ought to be/are under the control of S?	6. <u>Decision Environment</u> What conditions of success ought to be/are outside the control of the decision maker?	
Sources of knowledge	7. <u>Expert</u> Who ought to be/is providing relevant knowledge and skills for S?	8. <u>Expertise</u> What ought to be/are relevant-knowledge and skills for S?	9. <u>Guarantor</u> What ought to be/are regarded as assurances of successful implementation?	
Sources of legitimacy	10. <u>Witness</u> Who ought to be/is representing the interests of those negatively affected by but not involved with S?	11. <u>Emancipation</u> What ought to be/are the opportunities for the interests of those negatively affected to have expression and freedom from the worldview of S?	12. <u>Worldview</u> What space ought to be/is available for reconciling differing worldviews regarding S among those involved and affected?	The affected

Ulrich and Reynolds, 2010 p.244; adapted from Ulrich, 1996, p44

CSH Grid for Recording Perspectives

CSH Template on perspectives		Stakeholder (social role)	Stake (role concern)	Stakeholding issue (key problem)	
Sources of motivation		1 Beneficiary	2 Purpose	3 Measure of improvement	The involved
	<i>'ought'</i>				
	<i>'is'</i>				
	critique <i>'is'</i> against <i>'ought'</i>				
Sources of control		4 Decision-maker	5 Resources	6 Decision environment	
	<i>'ought'</i>				
	<i>'is'</i>				
	critique <i>'is'</i> against <i>'ought'</i>				
Sources of knowledge		7 Expert	8 Expertise	9 Guarantor/ assurance	
	<i>'ought'</i>				
	<i>'is'</i>				
	critique <i>'is'</i> against <i>'ought'</i>				
Sources of legitimacy		10 Witness	11 Emancipation	12 Worldview	The affected
	<i>'ought'</i>				
	<i>'is'</i>				
	critique <i>'is'</i> against <i>'ought'</i>				

Reynolds, M. (2014). Equity-focused developmental evaluation using critical systems thinking. *Evaluation – The International Journal of Theory, Research and Practice*, 20(1) pp. 75–95; adapted from Ulrich (1996)

Critical Systems Heuristic

Sources of influence	Boundary judgments informing a system of interest (S)			
	<i>Social roles (stakeholders)</i>	<i>Specific concerns (stakes)</i>	<i>Key problems (stakeholding issues)</i>	
Motivation	1. <u>Beneficiary</u>	2. <u>Purpose</u>	3. <u>Measure of improvement</u>	The involved
Control	4. <u>Decision maker</u>	5. <u>Resources</u>	6. <u>Decision Environment</u>	
Expertise	7. <u>Expert</u>	8. <u>Expertise</u>	9. <u>Guarantor</u>	
Legitimation	10. <u>Witness</u>	11. <u>Emancipation</u>	12. <u>Worldview</u>	The affected

Sources of influence	Boundary judgments informing a system of interest (S)			
	<i>Social roles (stakeholders)</i>	<i>Specific concerns (stakes)</i>	<i>Key problems (stakeholding issues)</i>	
Motivation	1. <u>Beneficiary</u> Rural poor, future generations and non-human nature	2. <u>Purpose</u> To improve natural resource use planning in addressing needs of the vulnerable	3. <u>Measure of improvement</u> (i) Rural poverty alleviation (ii) Enhanced condition of natural resources	The involved
Control	4. <u>Decision maker</u> Communal resource users	5. <u>Resources</u> Necessary components to enable NRUA, including (i) Project/ finance/human (ii) Social networks	6. <u>Decision Environment</u> (i) Interest groups affected by NRUA (ii) Expertise not beholden to decision maker	
Expertise	7. <u>Expert</u> Communal resource users informed by natural & social scientists and other sources of relevant knowledge & experience	8. <u>Expertise</u> Technical/experiential / social knowledge & skills including (i) Rural peoples' knowledge & experience (ii) Interdisciplinary & intersectoral facilitation skills (iii) Social & environmental responsibility	9. <u>Guarantor</u> Competent professional & nonprofessional knowledge avoiding (i) Scientism (sole reliance on objective & statistical fact) (ii) Managerialism (sole reliance on facilitating communication) (iii) Populism (allowing loudest collective voice as sole guarantor)	
Legitimation	10. <u>Witness</u> Collective citizenry representing interests of all (including private sector) affected by NRUA, both local & global; present & future generations	11. <u>Emancipation</u> NRUA open to challenge from those adversely affected, including interests of private land owners & diamond industry competing for access to communal resources	12. <u>Worldview</u> Manage conflicts of interest between: (i) National economic growth, privatization & fencing policies (ii) Vulnerable rural livelihoods & nature	The affected